

IGTM Annual Conference - Jahrestagung 2024

"*The End: Finiteness, Death, and Completion in Medieval Theology*"

26 June – 28 June 2024, Utrecht, The Netherlands

Abstracts

Rainer Berndt, *Die Memoria der Könige Frankreichs in der Totenliturgie der Pariser Abtei Saint-Victor im Mittelalter*

Mein Papier handelt in drei Teilen von den Königen Frankreichs im Mittelalter, beispielhaft anhand der Memoria des hl. Ludwig sowie der *Libri ordinarii* der Pariser Abtei Saint-Victor. Die Memoria der Könige Frankreichs, allen voran die Memoria König Ludwigs IX., wird in drei Schritten dargeboten: Zu allererst sollen die *Libri ordinarii* der Abtei der Regularkanoniker von Paris dargestellt und besprochen werden (I). Anschließend werden einige Dokumente der Memoria des heiligen Königs Ludwig von Frankreich entfaltet und gewichtet (II). Zuletzt sollen Memorial-Elemente aus der königlichen Tradition der Viktoriner zu Paris vorgestellt werden (III).

Charles Caspers, *Viaticum: The sine qua non for a Good Death (c. 1200 - c. 1500)*

In the 13th century, public life within Western Christianity was enriched with a new ritual: bringing the viaticum, the last communion, to the home of a sick or dying person. Every day, small processions moved from the parish church through the streets of towns and villages, and across the countryside. Bystanders were expected to kneel and pray as the procession passed. Sick persons were required to recite a Eucharistic creed. Only if they met that condition were they allowed to receive the spiritual provisions to travel the road to eternal life. Exceptional people, such as Francis, often received the viaticum under miraculous circumstances. With this monopoly for a good death, the institutional Church strengthened its hold on the lives of the faithful.

Antonio Pio di Cosmo, *The Funeral of Basileus and the Book of Ceremonies: Literary Data and Ceremonial Context*

This contribution analyzes the role of status symbols and the imperial outfit during the imperial funeral. The aim of this paper is to understand the functionality of the basileus' garments as an important element of the East Roman monarchy's apparatus of the ninth and tenth centuries. In particular, it explains the function of that dress with the death of the basileus. It aims to provide a reinterpretation of the basileus' self-representation strategies connected to a moment of rupture, caused by death. It is also a contribution to the history of costume. Of central importance is a series of mechanisms, triggered by the ostentation of specific clothing, and stimulated by the death of the basileus.

David B. Couturier, *The Death of the Franciscan Person: A Psycho-Phenomenological Perspective*

This paper will study the social and organizational dimension to death within the context of Franciscan life. It will be argued that how Franciscans die is patterned by the "death system" formed within the particular social and cultural contexts of Franciscan life. This system is

shaped by the metanarratives found in the death and dying scenes in the official lives of Francis. We will study this question of a “death system” in the writings of three noted scholars of Franciscanism: Thomas Nairn OFM, Daniel Horan OFM, and Dr. Emmanuel Falque.

Balázs Danka, *The Burial of the Greatest Emperor?*

In the winter of 1378, the popular emperor of the German-Roman Empire, IV. Charles died. The emperor's death is mentioned in many sources, such as the work of the anonymous Augsburg chronicler, or MS II 15. In my presentation, I want to find an answer to the question: what could have motivated the events that took place at the funeral of the German emperor? Is it a unique funeral or was it influenced by other funeral ceremonies? Where did the idea come from, and what made the funeral of the German emperor so unique? A defining element of 14th-century Europe was the mourning procession connected with personification.

Monika Eisenhauer, *The Function of Death in the Visionary Literature of the Early Middle Ages*

In the Early Middle Ages, the so-called visionary literature emerged. Examples are the *visio Drythelmi* and the *visio Fursei* by Beda Venerabilis or the *visio de monachi de Wenlock* by Boniface. All of them are based on the Apocalypse of Paul, or *visio Pauli*, written by an unknown author in the fifth century. The *visio Pauli* became the template for the texts of the visionary literature: a man is seriously ill and dies. After his death, he finds himself in the afterlife. A guide from the hereafter shows him the horrors of hell and the benefits of the heaven. With this knowledge, the dead person is then sent back to life to share his experiences. This paper will answer the question of why and how death is used in this context.

Alberto Ferreiro, *St. Vicent Ferrer on Predestination, Free Will, and Judas Iscariot in a Catalán Sermon*

A great amount of writing has been dedicated by Christian theologians surrounding questions about the afterlife. How does one get to heaven or avoid hell? Who goes to Purgatory? What is the role of evil or good works in determining a person's eternal destination. Has God already chosen the saved and the damned in advance? What is the difference between God's Foreknowledge as opposed to Predestination and their interplay with one another? Is double Predestination a valid Christian teaching? Was Judas Iscariot created solely to betray Christ, thus having no free will in the matter? Vicent Ferrer (1350-1419) in the Catalán sermon for the Vigil of the Apostle Andrew engaged some of these questions. His approach and explanations are creative but with no theological breakthroughs, his is a traditional position. His contribution, however, to the topic was important for his era. A central question emerges: Why did he feel the need to address the question of double Predestination and Foreknowledge in the first place? This study attempts to find some answers to these questions.

Veerle Fraeters, *Postmortem Conversations: Clerical and Lay Agency in Late Medieval Vernacular Ghost Dialogues*

With the emergence of purgatorial devotion from the late twelfth century onwards, texts on ghosts proliferated. Within the body of late medieval *exempla* on visitations of the dead, a distinct subgenre can be identified, characterized by its length and dialogical format. These “ghost dialogues” typically include a narrative about the spirit’s journey from purgatory to heaven, aided by the devotional efforts of the living. Additionally, they feature discussions of various eschatological themes. In this paper, I analyze an understudied Middle Dutch dialogue between two laywomen, situating it within the broader context of late medieval Latin and vernacular “ghost dialogues”. I specifically focus on the roles and agency of clerics and laypeople in texts that deal with spectral communication.

Alexander Heindel, *The End is God – Mystical-Eschatological Elements in the Sermons of John Tauler*

The medieval mystic Johannes Tauler lived in the 14th century, mainly in Strasbourg. There he preached and undertook pastoral care for nuns, beguines, and lay people. In his sermons he describes eschatology as a process and in a double way: on the one hand, it is as definite end of human and world; on the other hand, it is as an end of the mystical process. For both processes Tauler describes the elements of dying, death, and eternal life as stations. These will be described through some examples like the status of sin, the last judgement, mystical experience, eternal life, and the life as “Gottesfreund”.

Michael Lebzelter, *Preparing for the End: Performing the Personal Judgement and the Last Judgement in Medieval Religious Plays*

Medieval religious drama focusses on the “end” in different perspectives: on the one hand, the personal death and a personal judgement after it (*judicium particulare* according to Thomas Aquinas) is performed in morality plays, on the other hand, the Last Judgement is staged in plays, too. Both types intent to prepare the audience for what will happen in the future to be more sure about Divine Judgement and about personal salvation. The paper examines the interconnections between those genres, focussing on theological as well as social implications concerning piety. Furthermore, the specific characteristics of those plays in contrast to other media are examined.

Volker Leppin, *In hora mortis: Death and Dying in the Hortulus animae*

Prayer books describe and organize religious life. Shaping a Christian’s path through life, they bring us closer to individuality than a rule or a collection of laws does. The paper takes an example from the *Hortulus animae*, the most widespread vernacular prayer book in late medieval Germany. It focuses on daily life, embraced by death, preparations for the hour of death, and meditations on Christ’s death. This journey through the prayers will show the ambiguity when approaching God as a savior, temporal or eternal.

Luciano Micali, *Matter, Form, and the Ultimate Purpose of the Human Life in Jean Gerson's Centilogium de causa finali*

In the *Centilogium de causa finali* (1426), Jean Gerson inserts the discourse on matter and form in a more general philosophical and theological discussion on how the human intellect is driven by the will towards its ultimate purpose or final cause, God, who attracts and teaches the *forma rationalis hominis* on how to be directed towards its goal. In my paper, I will analyze Gerson's reflection in *Centilogium de causa finali* on the relation between intellect and final cause of the human being in connection with the use and misuse of the intellectual faculties, of the disciplines, and of philosophy.

Jyrki Nissi, "He had not yet fully completed the dying" – Gradual Transition from Life to Death in Late Medieval Resurrection Miracles

The line between life and death was not clear in the Middle Ages. Medieval people could describe someone to be *mortuus* even if person's body still inhabited some signs of life. This becomes exceptionally clear in resurrection miracles that were recorded in medieval canonization processes and miracle collections. Sometimes terms such as *semi mortuus* or *quasi mortuus* were used to describe that a person was somewhere between life and death. Dying was a process that had a beginning and an end.

David Pedersen, *Human Contingency and Expected Utility in the Old English Wisdom Tradition*

The Seafarer values the "joys of the Lord" above "life...on land"; *The Wanderer* finds hope in "the Father in Heaven"; and Saturn in *Solomon and Saturn II* finds comfort in the promise of divine rest "among the blessed." In every case, this subordination of a temporal to an eternal perspective comes exclusively from considering the finitude of life on earth. I believe this focus on the contingency of human experience in Old English wisdom literature defines a culturally distinct expression of Christian identity, an expression that turns the heroic commitment to facing *wyrd* into an act of worship.

Jan Reitzner, *Mortificatio and Physcial Death in the Re-formations of the Verba Seniorum in the Middle Ages*

The *Verba Seniorum*, as the Latin tradition of the *Apophthegmata Patrum*, have enjoyed great prestige in the Latin West. The extensive manuscript tradition, but also numerous references in sermons and devotional writings, bear witness to this. However, the concrete ethical question of present *mortificatio* in its relationship to *ars moriendi* at the end of physical life, was answered in various ways. This diversity can be seen in the collections, later revisions in the manuscript tradition, but also in spiritual writings, like the *Diadema Monachorum*. The *Verba Seniorum* proved to be an authoritative framework within which individual theological concerns could be pursued with great freedom.

Erica Ridderman, *Justice and Mercy in Aquinas*

The relationship of justice and mercy – in both theology and ethics – is a perennial question in Christian theology. Aquinas makes a bold intervention into medieval debates, claiming that justice and mercy are not at odds (as if justice demanded one thing, and mercy another) but

compatible in God. In fact, he says, justice is “founded” upon mercy since God’s merciful act of creation preceded God’s just ordering. I show how this account – appreciated but under-investigated by modern theologians like Balthasar and Kasper – stems directly from Aquinas’s account of divine love as willing the good of others. Aquinas’s logic is pushed to its breaking point, however, when he tackles eschatological matters. What he labored to show compatible becomes separated once again: mercy belongs most clearly to the saved, and justice to the damned. As a result, I argue, he severely distorts his conception of divine love.

Innocent Smith, *Prayers for the Dead in Medieval Dominican Liturgy and Theology*

Medieval Dominican legislation emphasized the importance of praying for the dead, mandating the annual celebration of anniversaries of deceased parents, friars, and benefactors as well as requiring the celebration of Requiem masses on the occasion of the deaths of friars and other persons connected with the Order. This paper will examine the texts of the prayers provided in 13th century Dominican missals before and after the mid 13th-century reform of Humbert of Romans, showing the relationship of these orations to the broader Latin liturgical tradition and tracing their influence on the writings of Dominican theologians such as Albert the Great and Thomas Aquinas.

Ulrike Treusch, *Bene mori est libenter mori: The Ars Moriendi of the 15th century “School of Vienna”*

With his *Opus Tripartitum* (1408) Jean Gerson created the text genre of the late medieval *Ars Moriendi*. His work was translated into the vernacular; both the Latin and German versions experienced an intensive reception and further development of the genre, especially in 15th century reform circles. The paper focuses on *Ars Moriendi*-texts written by authors of the University of Vienna, e.g. by Johannes Nider (*Dispositorium moriendi*, post 1435) or Thomas Peuntner. Their texts serve as examples to show how Gerson's *Ars Moriendi* was received and adapted to a new context.

Luke Togni, *Pleasing in the Eyes of the Lord is the Death of the Saints: Eriugena and Bonaventure on Mystical Death*

This paper will undertake two tasks. The first is a comparison of Eriugena’s and Bonaventure’s use of *transitus* in the *Periphyseon* and *Itinerarium*, respectively, to name a mystical death, an experience of God in this life. In particular, it will compare the way manner in which the supraincidental God is approached by the intellectual creature, by transcending the intellect (in Bonaventure’s case) or the intellect’s transcending itself (Eriugena). The second task is a consideration of whether Eriugena’s use of *transitus* as mystical death offered an impetus for his own, since that passage of the *Periphyseon* was preserved in the *Corpus Dionysiacum Parisiense* (BnF Lat 17341) and potentially available to Bonaventure.

Isabell Văth, *The Return of the Pope: The Lord’s Prayer and its Importance on the Assurance of Salvation*

Several late medieval manuscripts in the library of St. Gallen contain a narrative that refers to the importance of the Lord’s Prayer at death’s door: a chaplain advises the dying pope to pray

three Lord's Prayers and combines this with corresponding explanations. The texts thus emphasise the uncertainty of salvation, but also seek an instrument of certainty – in one text, the Pope finally returns to confirm that he has escaped judgement. The paper will examine the narrative integration and mediation of the *ars moriendi*, the role ascribed to the Lord's Prayer and how creatively and productively this text is dealt with in its various versions.

Filip Veber, *Thomistic Approach to The Question of Christ's Human Nature After the Resurrection and Ascension as Exemplary Cause of Our Resurrection*

First, we will analyse some aspects of Christ's resurrection and ascension in Aquinas, focusing on the *Summa theologiae*, to show Aquinas's position. Second, we will attempt a speculative Thomistic approach regarding the subsistence of Christ's human nature in the Trinity, drawing also on the question of *Carnis Resurrectionem*. We will argue that Christ in his glorified nature stands as an exemplary cause of our resurrection and the final end. Lastly, we will draw some conclusions for the Catholic faith, on the basis of professing the fullness of Christ's humanity, connected with the question of the *Carnis Resurrectionem* and the implications that this has for our faith and attitude towards the death and afterlife.

Rudi te Velde, *Aquinas on Death: Natural and/or Penal?*

In the Middle Ages there were two basic views of the fact of human death. According to one, death is something natural. The fact that people die is explained by their bodily nature. According to the other, religious view, death is first and foremost a punishment for sin. Only after the first sin of Adam did death enter human life. These two views may seem incompatible. However, we see that Aquinas attempts to combine these two approaches to death in a fascinating way. In my paper I will propose an interpretation of how he integrates these views.

Lina VIDAUSKYTĖ, *Miles Christianus: Theological Drama over the Crusader's Body*

Several medieval sources shed light on the crusader's preparation for death in the Baltic region in the 13th century. To these belong Henry of Latvia's (1187- after 1259) *Livonian Chronicle*, the *Songe du vieil pelerin* (1389) by Philippe de Mézières (1327-1405), one of the famous propagandists of the Crusades, and the chronicle of Byzantine historian John Malala (491-578). In the latter, the myth of Sovius was described in which we can read about the "disgusting" custom of cremation of the dead, widespread in the Baltic region. *Songe du vieil pelerin* is a significant source because it uses many testimonies. Philippe de Mézières described the funeral of the Lithuanian king. In that description, we read about the offer to a prisoner to be burned together with the pagan ruler. An interesting discussion is presented, allowing certain theological conclusions to be drawn about the behavior of the crusader in the face of such a disgusting death and his preoccupation with the posthumous fate of the body.

Niklas Voltmann, *As if in Purgatory: Soteriological Dimensions of Death by Disease in a 15th-Century Hamburgian Ars moriendi*

To die "as if in Purgatory" – this analogy taken from the *Scientia mortis* of medieval theologian Jean Gerson – defines the *Ars moriendi* found in one of fourteen 15th-century prayerbooks previously owned by a convent of Hamburgian Beguines. Surprisingly

independent from known sources, this theology of being terminally ill centers around this analogy and, in the context of the whole book, interprets death by disease as a form of martyrdom and challenge of one's own believe, love, and obedience to God. In this, it shows yet undiscovered traces of theological influences with possible leads to the Franciscans of Lübeck.